## Appendix 3

Order of Court of Appeal 20 May 2013



# COURT 72

C1/2012/2689

Appeal No.

#### MONDAY 20TH MAY 2013

#### IN THE COURT OF APPEAL

ON APPEAL FROM THE HIGH COURT OF JUSTICE QUEEN'S BENCH DIVISION ADMINISTRATIVE COURT

CO8992011

BEFORE

AND

LORD JUSTICE MAURICE KAY Vice President of the Court of Appeal, Civil

Division

LADY JUSTICE BLACK LADY JUSTICE RAFFERTY

IN THE MATTER OF a claim for judicial review

BETWEEN

THE QUEEN (ON THE APPLICATION OF)

(1)TRIAL RIDERS FELLOWSHIP

FIRST CLAIMANT/

APPELLANT

- and -

(2)DAVID LEONARD TILBURY

SECOND CLAIMANT

- and -

DORSET COUNTY COUNCIL

DEFENDANT/ FIRST

RESPONDENT

- and -

(1) SECRETARY OF STATE FOR ENVIRONMENT, FOOD AND RURAL AFFAIRS

FIRST INTERESTED PARTY/ SECOND RESPONDENT

- and -

(2)MR GRAHAM PLUMBE

SECOND INTERESTED PARTY/ THIRD RESPONDENT

UPON HEARING Counsel for the Appellant, Leading Counsel for the First Respondent and the Third Respondent in person

- 1. The appeal is allowed on Ground 1.
- 2. Permission to appeal is refused on Ground 2.
- 3. The order of Mr Justice Supperstone dated 2 October 2012 is set aside.
- 4. The claim for judicial review of the decision of the First Defendant dated 2 November 2010 is allowed.



- 5. It is declared that the five applications dated 14/7/04 (ref. T338), 25/9/04 (ref. T339), 21/12/04 (ref. T350), 21/12/04 (ref. 353) and 21/12/04 (ref. T354) under section 53(5) Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 were made in accordance with paragraph 1 Schedule 14 Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981.
- 6. The First Defendant will proceed to determine such applications in accordance with the provisions of Schedule 14 Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981.
- 7. The First Defendant will by 4.00pm 3 June 2013:
  - 7.1. Repay to the Appellant the sum of £5,000 paid to the First Respondent pursuant to the order of Mr Justice Supperstone dated 2 October 2012;
  - 7.2. Pay the Appellant's costs of the proceedings in the Court below in the agreed sum of £15,000 (inclusive of VAT).
  - 7.3. Pay the Appellant's costs of the appeal in the agreed sum of £10,000 (inclusive of VAT).
- 8. Permission to appeal to the Supreme Court is refused.





### MONDAY 20TH MAY 2013 IN THE COURT OF APPEAL

ON APPEAL FROM THE HIGH COURT OF JUSTICE QUEEN'S BENCH DIVISION ADMINISTRATIVE COURT

IN THE MATTER OF a claim for judicial review

#### **ORDER**

Copies to:

Queen's Bench Division - Administrative Court Room C317 Royal Courts of Justice The Strand London WC2A 2LL

Brain Chase Coles
Dx 3005
Basinstoke
Ref: MSS/TRF/DORSET

Dorset County Council Legal And Democratic Services Dx 8716 Dorchester Ref: SLM/E105678

Thomas Eggar Llp Dx 85715 Crawley Ref: PPG/JRP/2312/45106495

Treasury Solicitors
Dx 123242
Kingsway 6
Ref: JULIETTE DEVANI

<sup>\*</sup> This order was drawn by Mr J Hebden (Associate) to whom all enquiries regarding this order should be made. When communicating with the Court please address correspondence to Mr J Hebden, Civil Appeals Office, Room E307, Royal Courts of Justice, Strand, London WC2A 2LL (DX 44450 Strand) and quote the Court of Appeal reference number. The Associate's telephone number is 020 7947 7896